Limits in Compact Abelian Groups

Joan E. Hart† and Kenneth Kunen‡§

September 28, 2004

Abstract

For $X$ a compact abelian group and $B$ an infinite subset of its dual $\hat{X}$, let $C_B$ be the set of all $x \in X$ such that $\langle \varphi(x) : \varphi \in B \rangle$ converges to 1. If $\mathcal{F}$ is a free filter on $\hat{X}$, let $D_\mathcal{F} = \bigcup \{C_B : B \in \mathcal{F} \}$. The sets $C_B$ and $D_\mathcal{F}$ are subgroups of $X$. $C_B$ always has Haar measure 0, while the measure of $D_\mathcal{F}$ depends on $\mathcal{F}$. We show that there is a filter $\mathcal{F}$ such that $D_\mathcal{F}$ has measure 0 but is not contained in any $C_B$. This generalizes previous results for the special case where $X$ is the circle group.

1 Introduction

In this paper we study the pointwise convergence of sequences of characters of compact abelian groups and its relation to Bohr topologies. We begin with some abstract definitions. All spaces considered here are assumed to be Hausdorff.

Definition 1.1 If $X,Y$ are topological spaces, then $C(X,Y)$ is the set of continuous functions from $X$ to $Y$, and $C_p(X,Y)$ denotes $C(X,Y)$ given the topology of pointwise convergence (i.e., regarding $C_p(X,Y)$ as a subset of $Y^X$ with the usual product topology). If $Y$ contains a distinguished point 1, then $\mathbf{1}$ denotes the constant function $x \mapsto 1$ in $C(X,Y)$.

*2000 Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary 54H11, 22C05; Secondary 43A40. Key Words and Phrases: Compact group, character, Bohr topology, pointwise convergence.
†University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh, WI 54901, U.S.A., hartj@uwosh.edu
‡University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI 53706, U.S.A., kunen@math.wisc.edu
§Both authors partially supported by NSF Grant DMS-0097881.
See Arkhangel’skii [1] for a discussion of such function spaces.

Suppose $X$ is a compact abelian group and $Y = \mathbb{T} \subseteq \mathbb{C}$, where $\mathbb{T}$ is the circle group. As usual (see [6, 9, 13]), $\hat{X}$ denotes the dual group of $X$; that is, the group of characters, or continuous homomorphisms into $\mathbb{T}$; then $\hat{1}$ is the identity element of $\hat{X}$. If $G = \hat{X}$ and we view $G$ as a discrete abelian group, then $X \cong G$ by the Pontrjagin Duality Theorem. However, if we consider $G \subseteq C_p(X, \mathbb{T})$, then its inherited topology is the Bohr topology on $G$, and the closure of $G$ in $\mathbb{T}^X$ is the Bohr compactification, $bG$, of $G$. $G^\#$ denotes $G$ with its Bohr topology. Since the compact group $bG$ is dense in itself, and $G^\#$ is dense in $bG$, we have:

**Lemma 1.2** If $X$ is an infinite compact abelian group, then $\hat{X}$ is dense in itself in the topology inherited from $C_p(X, \mathbb{T})$.

However, $\hat{X}$ has no pointwise convergent sequences. To study pointwise convergence, we use the following notation:

**Definition 1.3** If $X,Y$ are topological spaces, $y \in Y$, and $B \subseteq C(X,Y)$ is infinite, then $C_B(y)$ is the set of all $x \in X$ such that the sequence $\langle \varphi(x) : \varphi \in B \rangle$ converges to $y$ (that is, every neighborhood of $y$ contains $\varphi(x)$ for all but finitely many $\varphi \in B$). $\tilde{C}_B = \bigcup_{y \in Y} C_B(y)$. If $Y$ is a topological group with identity $1$, then $C_B$ denotes $C_B(1)$.

If $X$ and $Y$ are topological groups and $B$ is a family of homomorphisms, then $C_B$ and $\tilde{C}_B$ are subgroups of $X$. Clearly, $C_B \subseteq \tilde{C}_B$. The sequence $\langle \varphi : \varphi \in B \rangle$ converges pointwise (i.e., in $C_p(X,Y)$) iff $\tilde{C}_B = X$. So when $X$ is compact abelian and $B \subseteq \hat{X}$, $\tilde{C}_B$ can never equal $X$, but it can be non-trivial. In §2 we prove the following, which gives some results involving the sizes of $C_B$ and $\tilde{C}_B$:

**Theorem 1.4** Let $X$ be an infinite compact abelian group with $G = \hat{X}$. Then:

1. $\tilde{C}_B$ is a Haar null set for each infinite $B \subseteq G$.
2. For any countable $Q \subseteq X$, there is an infinite $B \subseteq \hat{X}$ such that $Q \subseteq C_B$, $C_B$ contains a perfect subset, and $C_B$ is dense in $X$.
3. $\lambda(B) \leq 1/|\tilde{C}_B|$ for all infinite $B \subseteq G$. Here, $\overline{B}$ is the closure of $B$ in $bG$, $\lambda$ is the Haar probability measure on $bG$, and $1/|\tilde{C}_B| = 0$ when $|\tilde{C}_B|$ is infinite.

So, every $\tilde{C}_B$ is small in the sense of measure, but by (2), for some $B$ even the smaller $C_B$ is big in other senses. And (3) implies that whenever $\tilde{C}_B$ is infinite, $B$ itself is small in the sense that $\overline{B}$ is a Haar null set in $bG$. 
1 INTRODUCTION

When \( X = \mathbb{T} \), the fact that \( \mathcal{C}_B \) is null is pointed out in [2, 4].

Note that both \( \mathcal{C}_B \) and \( \tilde{\mathcal{C}}_B \) get bigger as \( B \) gets smaller, so that the detailed arguments in this paper will only involve countable \( B \). For example, it is sufficient to prove (1) for countable \( B \), and the \( B \) produced in the proof of (2) will be countable.

If \( X = \mathbb{T} \), then \( \hat{\mathbb{T}} \subset C(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T}) \) is the set of functions \( z \mapsto z^n \) for \( n \in \mathbb{Z} \); we identify \( \hat{\mathbb{T}} \) with \( \mathbb{Z} \). As an illustration of (3), let \( B = \{ kn : n \in \mathbb{Z} \} \). Then \( \mathcal{C}_B = \tilde{\mathcal{C}}_B = \{ z \in \mathbb{T} : z^k = 1 \} \), and \( \lambda(B) = 1/k = 1/|\tilde{\mathcal{C}}_B| = 1/|\mathcal{C}_B| \).

For \( X = \mathbb{T} \), Barbieri, Dikranjan, Milan, and Weber [2] showed that assuming Martin’s Axiom, there is a Haar null subgroup \( D \) of \( \mathbb{T} \) which is not contained in any \( \mathcal{C}_B \). In [7] we showed that this holds in ZFC; in fact, we gave an explicit definition of such a \( D \) which is a Borel set in \( \mathbb{T} \).

There are two natural generalizations of these results about \( C(\mathbb{T}, \mathbb{T}) \). First, one may study the maps \( (z \mapsto z^n) \in C(X, X) \) for any compact group \( X \); this was done in [7]. In this paper, we consider the second generalization. For an arbitrary compact abelian group \( X \), we have \( B \subseteq \hat{X} \subset C(X, \mathbb{T}) \). We shall produce (Theorem 1.9) a Haar null subgroup \( D \) of \( X \) such that \( D \) is not contained in any countable union of the form \( \bigcup \tilde{\mathcal{C}}_{B_i} \). As in [7], it is convenient to define the null group \( D \) from a filter:

**Definition 1.5** Suppose that \( X, Y \) are topological spaces, \( y \in Y \), and \( \mathcal{F} \) is a free filter on the set \( C(X, Y) \). Then \( D_\mathcal{F}(y) = \bigcup \{ \mathcal{C}_B(y) : B \in \mathcal{F} \} \), and \( \tilde{D}_\mathcal{F} = \bigcup \{ \tilde{\mathcal{C}}_B : B \in \mathcal{F} \} \). If \( Y \) is a topological group with identity \( 1 \), then \( D_\mathcal{F} \) denotes \( D_\mathcal{F}(1) \).

As usual, a filter \( \mathcal{F} \) is free iff it contains the complements of finite sets. As in [7], our null group \( D \) will be \( D_\mathcal{F} \), where \( \mathcal{F} \) is a filter of sets of asymptotic density one:

**Definition 1.6** For \( E \subseteq \omega \), let \( \underline{d}(E) \) and \( \overline{d}(E) \) denote the lower and upper asymptotic density:

\[
d(E) = \liminf_{n \to \infty} \frac{|E \cap n|}{n} \leq \limsup_{n \to \infty} \frac{|E \cap n|}{n} = \overline{d}(E) .
\]

If equality holds, let \( d(E) = \underline{d}(E) = \overline{d}(E) \) denote the asymptotic density of \( E \).

**Definition 1.7** Let \( X \) be a compact abelian group and let \( \varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle \) be a sequence of distinct elements of \( \hat{X} \). Then \( \mathcal{F}_\varphi \) is the filter \( \mathcal{F} \) generated by all sets of the form \( \{ \varphi_n : n \in E \} \) such that \( d(E) = 1 \).
Proposition 1.8 For $\mathcal{F}_\varphi$ defined as in 1.7, $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ is a Haar null subgroup of $X$.

Note that $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ is clearly a subgroup. We prove that it is null in §2. The group $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ could be trivial; for example, if $X = T$ and $\varphi_n(z) = z^n$, then $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi} = \{1\}$. In [7], our null subgroup of $T$ was of the form $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$, where $\varphi_n(z) = z^n!$.

The null group $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ contains $D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$. Nevertheless, Theorem 1.9 shows that for suitable $\varphi$, even $D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ is not contained in any countable union of $\tilde{C}_B$ sets.

Theorem 1.9 For any infinite compact abelian group $X$, there is a $D$ such that:

1. $D$ is a Haar null subgroup of $X$;
2. $D$ is dense in $X$;
3. $D$ is not a subset of any countable union of the form $\bigcup_{\ell} \tilde{C}_{B_\ell}$, where each $B_\ell$ is an infinite subset of $\hat{X}$;
4. $D = D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ for some sequence of distinct characters $\varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$.

The proof of Theorem 1.9 has two parts. In §4, we prove the theorem when $X$ is one of four types of “stock” compact groups. And in §3, we show that it is sufficient to prove the theorem for those stock groups. This argument applies the structure theory for abelian groups to $\hat{X}$, and is similar to the analysis used in constructing $I_0$ sets (Hartman and Ryll-Nardzewski [8], Thm. 5; see also [12]).

The stock groups are all second countable (that is, their $|\hat{X}|$ are countable). The $|\hat{X}|$ in Proposition 1.8 and Theorem 1.9 can be an arbitrary infinite cardinal. However, since $\tilde{C}_B$ gets bigger as $B$ gets smaller, it is sufficient to prove Theorem 1.9 in the case that all the $B_\ell$ are countable. For countable $B$, $C_B$ and $\tilde{C}_B$ are Borel (in fact, $F_{\sigma\delta}$) sets; likewise, $D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ and $\tilde{D}_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ are $F_{\sigma\delta}$ sets (see Proposition 5.3).

Our results are related to the notions of $g$-closure and $g$-density described by Dikranjan, Milan, and Tonolo [5]. These notions may be expressed in terms of an intersection involving our $C_B$:

**Definition 1.10** Let $X$ be a compact abelian group, and $J \leq X$, with $\overline{J}$ its (usual topological) closure. Then $g_X(J) = \overline{J} \cap \bigcap \{C_B : B \in [\hat{X}]^{<\aleph_0} \cap J \subseteq C_B\}$.

They call $g_X(J)$ the $g$-closure of $J$ and say that $J$ is $g$-dense iff $g_X(J) = X$. Barbieri, Dikranjan, Milan, and Weber [3] ask (see Question 5.7) whether for every infinite compact abelian group, there is a $g$-dense subgroup which is a Haar null set, and they provide an affirmative answer under Martin’s Axiom in some cases. Our $D$ from Theorem 1.9 provides an affirmative answer in all cases in ZFC.
2 Elementary Facts

Proposition 1.8 is easily proved using Cesàro limits:

**Definition 2.1** Given \( r_n \in \mathbb{C} \) for \( n \in \omega \) and \( s \in \mathbb{C} \), \( r_n \sim s \) means that \( \frac{1}{j} \sum_{n<j} r_n \) converges to \( s \) as \( j \to \infty \).

**Lemma 2.2** Fix \( r_n \in \mathbb{C} \) for \( n \in \omega \) and \( s \in \mathbb{C} \). Assume that there is an \( M \geq 0 \) such that \( |r_n| \leq M \) for all \( n \), and that \( \lim_{n \in E} r_n = s \) for some \( E \subseteq \omega \) with \( d(E) = 1 \). Then \( r_n \sim s \).

The following is proved exactly like Lemma 4.9 of [12], although the basic idea for the proof goes back to Weyl [15]§7.

**Lemma 2.3** Let \( \mu \) be a probability measure on \( X \). Let \( \varphi_n : X \to \mathbb{C} \), for \( n \in \omega \), be measurable. Assume that \( M \geq 0 \), \( |\varphi_n(x)| \leq M \) for all \( n \) and \( x \), and the \( \varphi_n \) are orthogonal in \( L^2(\mu) \). Then \( \mu(\{x \in X : \varphi_n(x) \sim 0\}) = 1 \).

**Proof of Proposition 1.8.** Use Lemma 2.2 and 2.3. Here, the \( \varphi_n \) map into \( T \), so \( D_{\varphi_n}(0) = \emptyset \), so that \( D_{\varphi_n} \) is disjoint from \( \{x \in X : \varphi_n(x) \sim 0\} \). \( \square \)

The next lemma is immediate from the Pontrjagin Duality Theorem:

**Lemma 2.4** For compact abelian \( X \) and \( Y \), if \( \hat{Y} \) is isomorphic to a subgroup of \( \hat{X} \), then there is a continuous homomorphism \( \pi \) mapping \( X \) onto \( Y \).

Given compact abelian \( X \), we can choose \( Y \) so that \( \hat{Y} \) is a countable subgroup of \( \hat{X} \). Then \( Y \) is second countable. This sometimes lets us reduce a statement about arbitrary \( X \) to a statement about second countable groups, as is illustrated in the proof below of Theorem 1.4(2). It is also useful to recall:

**Lemma 2.5** If \( \pi \) is a continuous homomorphism mapping the compact group \( X \) onto \( Y \), then \( \pi \) is both a closed map and an open map. Also, \( \lambda_X(\pi^{-1}(E)) = \lambda_Y(E) \) for all Haar-measurable \( E \subseteq Y \), where \( \lambda_X, \lambda_Y \) are the Haar probability measures on \( X, Y \), respectively.

To prove Theorem 1.4(3), we need:

**Lemma 2.6** Every infinite discrete abelian group \( G \) is a Haar null subset of \( bG \).
This lemma is immediate from Varopoulos [14], who proves a more general result. To prove the result directly for discrete abelian groups, note that for countable ones, the result is trivial. So for an arbitrary infinite discrete abelian $G$, take a homomorphism $\pi$ from $G$ onto a countable $H$, and then note that $\pi$ induces $b\pi : bG \to bH$, with $G \subseteq (b\pi)^{-1}(H)$.

The following lemma is also needed for Theorem 1.4(3):

**Lemma 2.7** Let $X$ be a compact abelian group with $G = \hat{X}$, and fix $u \in X$ and a subgroup $S$ of $G$. Let $K = \{x \in X : \forall \varphi \in S[\varphi(x) = \varphi(u)]\}$. Then $\lambda(K) = 1/|S|$, where $\lambda$ is Haar measure on $X$.

**Proof.** Let $\pi : X \to \hat{S}$ be the natural map. Viewing $X$ as the characters of $G$, we have

$$K = \{x \in X : \forall \varphi \in S[\varphi(x) = u(\varphi)]\} = \{x \in X : x|S = u|S\} = \pi^{-1}\{u|S\}.$$ 

Here, $u|S$ is a point in $\hat{S}$. Since $\pi$ preserves Haar measure (see Lemma 2.5), if $S$ is infinite then $\lambda(K) = 0$, while if $S$ is finite then $\lambda(K) = 1/|\hat{S}| = 1/|S|$. □

**Proof of Theorem 1.4.** Part (1) is clear from Proposition 1.8, since it is sufficient to prove it when $B$ is countable.

For (2), we shall produce a perfect subset of $X$ via a tree of open sets indexed by finite 0-1 sequences. Let $Q$ as $\{q_j : j \in \omega\}$. We now get distinct $\varphi_n \in \hat{X}$ for $n \in \omega$ and $U_s \subseteq X$ for $s \in 2^{<\omega} = \bigcup_{n \in \omega}\{0, 1\}^n$ so that:

- $U_s$ is open and nonempty.
- $\text{cl}(U_{s-0}) \cap \text{cl}(U_{s-1}) = \emptyset$ and $\text{cl}(U_{s-0}), \text{cl}(U_{s-1}) \subseteq U_s$.
- $|1 - \varphi_n(x)| < 1/n$ whenever $x \in \{q_j : j \leq n\} \cup \bigcup U_s : s \in 2^n\}$. 

We do this by induction on $n$. $\varphi_0$ can be arbitrary and $U_\emptyset$ can be $X$. If we are given $U_s$ for $s \in 2^n$ and $\varphi_0, \ldots, \varphi_n$: First, choose distinct $p_{s-0}, p_{s-1} \in U_s$. Then choose $\varphi_{n+1} \notin \{\varphi_0, \ldots, \varphi_n\}$ such that $|1 - \varphi_{n+1}(x)| < 1/(n + 1)$ whenever $x \in \{q_j : j \leq n + 1\} \cup \{p_t : t \in 2^{n+1}\}$; this is possible because $\vec{0} \in \hat{X} \subseteq C_p(X, T)$ and is not isolated in $\hat{X}$ (see Lemma 1.2). Then, we may choose $U_t$ for $t \in 2^{n+1}$ using the continuity of $\varphi_{n+1}$.

Let $K = \bigcap_{n \in \omega} \bigcup_{s \in 2^n} \text{cl}(U_s)$, and let $B = \{\varphi_n : n \in \omega\}$. Then $K \cup Q \subseteq C_B$. $K$ is not scattered, since it maps continuously onto the Cantor set, so its perfect kernel is non-empty.

We still need to get $C_B$ dense in $X$. If $X$ is separable, this is trivial, since we may assume that the countable $Q$ contains a dense subset of $X$. So for any $X$,
choose a second countable $Y$ with $\hat{Y} < \hat{X}$, and let $\pi : X \to Y$ be as in Lemma 2.4. For this separable $Y$, choose an infinite $B_Y \subseteq \hat{Y}$ such that $\pi(Q) \subseteq C_{B_Y}, C_{B_Y}$ is dense in $Y$, and $C_{B_Y}$ contains a perfect subset. Then $B = \{ \varphi \circ \pi : \varphi \in B_Y \}$ satisfies (2); since $\pi$ is an open map (Lemma 2.5), $C_B = \pi^{-1}(C_{B_Y})$ is dense in $X$.

For (3), define $\Theta : \tilde{C}_B \to \mathbb{T}$ so that $\Theta(x)$ is the limit of the sequence $\langle \varphi(x) : \varphi \in B \rangle$ (which exists by definition of $\tilde{C}_B$). Note that $\Theta$ is a homomorphism from the group $\tilde{C}_B$ into $\mathbb{T}$, so, since $\mathbb{T}$ is divisible, it extends to a homomorphism $\Theta : X \to \mathbb{T}$. Then $\tilde{C}_B = \{ x \in X : \langle \varphi(x) : \varphi \in B \rangle \to \Theta(x) \}$. Let $X_d$ denote the group $X$ with the discrete topology; then we can identify $bG$ with the compact group $\hat{X}_d$. So, $\Theta \in bG$. We can view $G^\#$ as a dense subgroup of $bG$, so that each $x \in X$ can be identified with a continuous homomorphism on $bG$. With this identification, each $x \in \tilde{C}_B$ satisfies $\langle x(\varphi) : \varphi \in B \rangle \to x(\Theta)$, so that $x(\Phi) = x(\Theta)$ for each $\Phi \in B \setminus B$. Thus, $\tilde{B} \setminus B = \{ \Phi \in bG : \forall x \in \tilde{C}_B [x(\Phi) = x(\Theta)] \}$, so that $\lambda(\tilde{B} \setminus B) \leq 1/|\tilde{C}_B|$ by applying Lemma 2.7; the $X, G, u, S$ in 2.7 becomes $bG, X, \Theta, \tilde{C}_B$ here. Finally, $\lambda(\tilde{B}) \leq 1/|\tilde{C}_B|$ because $B \subseteq G$, which, by Lemma 2.6, is a Haar null set in $bG$.

Just getting a $C_B$ that contains a perfect set is trivial in the case that $G = \hat{X}$ has an infinite subgroup $H$ with infinite index. Let $Z = \bigcap \{ \ker(\varphi) : \varphi \in H \}$. Then $Z \cong \hat{G}/\hat{H}$ is an infinite compact subgroup of $X$, and $Z = C_H$.

# 3 Reduction to Stock

In this section, we show that it is sufficient to prove Theorem 1.9 in the case that $X$ is the dual of one of the groups listed in the following lemma:

**Lemma 3.1** Every infinite abelian group contains a subgroup isomorphic to one of the following:

- $\mathbb{Z}$.
- $\sum_{n \in \omega} \mathbb{Z}_{p_n}$, where the $p_n$ are primes and $p_0 < p_1 < \cdots$.
- $\sum_{n \in \omega} \mathbb{Z}_p$, where $p$ is a fixed prime.
- $\mathbb{Z}_{p^\infty}$, for some prime $p$.

This lemma is part of the structure theory for infinite abelian groups (see Kaplansky [10], or Hewitt and Ross [9], or [12] §3). The duals of these four groups are, respectively, $\mathbb{T}$, $\prod_{n \in \omega} \mathbb{Z}_{p_n}$, $(\mathbb{Z}_p)^\omega$, and the $p$-adic integers; for the last one, see [9] §25.
Next, we use the $\pi : X \to Y$ obtained from Lemma 2.4 to translate a $\varphi$ satisfying Theorem 1.9 for $Y$ to a $\varphi \circ \pi$ satisfying Theorem 1.9 for $X$.

**Lemma 3.2** Let $X$ and $Y$ be compact abelian groups, with $\pi$ a continuous homomorphism mapping $X$ onto $Y$. Assume that $\varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ is a sequence of distinct characters of $Y$ such that $D_{\varphi}$ is not a subset of any countable union of the form $\bigcup A^\ell$, whenever each $A^\ell$ is an infinite subset of $\hat{Y}$. Let $\varphi \circ \pi = \langle \varphi_n \circ \pi : n \in \omega \rangle$. Then, in $X$, $D_{\varphi \circ \pi}$ is not a subset of any countable union of the form $\bigcup C_{B^\ell}$, whenever each $B^\ell$ is an infinite subset of $\hat{X}$. Also, if $D_{\varphi}$ is dense in $Y$ then $D_{\varphi \circ \pi}$ is dense in $X$.

**Proof.** Let $K = \ker(\pi)$. Since $\pi$ is an epimorphism, $X/K \cong Y$, so characters of $Y$ correspond to characters of $X/K$. Note also that each character in $\hat{X}$ restricts to one in $\hat{K}$. Since $\hat{C}_B$ gets bigger as $B$ gets smaller, we may shrink each $B^\ell$ to a countable set. Shrinking again to $B^\ell = \{\psi_n : n \in \omega\}$, we may assume that for each $\ell$, the $\psi_n^K$, for $n \in \omega$, are either all the same or are all different.

**Case 1:** The $\psi_n^K$, for $n \in \omega$, are all the same. So each $\psi_n^K(\psi_0^{-1})$ is identically $1$ on $K$, and hence yields a character $\delta_n^\ell \in \hat{X}/K \cong \hat{Y}$ (with $\psi_n^K \cdot (\psi_0^{-1}) = \delta_n^\ell \circ \pi$).

Let $A^\ell = \{\delta_n^\ell : n \in \omega\} \subseteq \hat{Y}$. By our assumption on $\varphi$, we can fix a $y \in Y$ such that $y \in D_{\varphi}$ and $y \notin \hat{C}_{A^\ell}$ for all Case 1 $\ell$. Note that if $x$ is any element of $\pi^{-1}\{y\}$, then $x \in D_{\varphi \circ \pi}$. Also, such an $x$ is not in $\hat{C}_{B^\ell}$ for all Case 1 $\ell$, because the non-convergence of $\langle \delta_n^\ell(y) : n \in \omega \rangle$ implies the non-convergence of $\langle \psi_n^K(x) \cdot (\psi_0^{-1})(x) \rangle^{-1}$, and hence the non-convergence of $\langle \psi_n^K(x) : n \in \omega \rangle$.

We are thus done if we produce $x \in \pi^{-1}\{y\}$ so that $x \notin \hat{C}_{B^\ell}$ for all Case 2 $\ell$. Fix $x^* \in \pi^{-1}\{y\}$. Then our desired $x$ will be an element of the coset $Kx^* = \pi^{-1}\{y\}$.

**Case 2:** The $\psi_n^K$, for $n \in \omega$, are all different. For all Case 2 $\ell$, define $f_n^\ell : K \to T$ by $f_n^\ell(t) = \psi_n^K(tx^*) = \psi_n^K(t) \cdot \psi_n^K(x^*)$. Note that each $f_n^\ell$ is the product of a character $\psi_n^K$ of $K$ with a number $\psi_n^K(x^*)$, so that $\{f_n^\ell : n \in \omega\}$ is an orthogonal family in $L^2(K)$. It follows, by using Lemma 2.3, that $\hat{C}_{\{f_n^\ell : n \in \omega\}}$ is a Haar null set in $K$. Choose $t$ such that for each Case 2 $\ell$ the sequence $\langle f_n^\ell(t) : n \in \omega \rangle$ does not converge; then $tx^* \notin \hat{C}_{B^\ell}$.

Finally, to prove that $D_{\varphi \circ \pi}$ is dense in $X$, use the facts that $\pi$ is an open map by Lemma 2.5, and that $D_{\varphi \circ \pi} = \pi^{-1}(D_{\varphi})$. \qed

## 4 Nice Groups

Definition 4.3 below isolates the key property of the groups $\hat{G}$, for the groups $G$ listed in Lemma 3.1.
Definition 4.1 If $X$ is a compact abelian group, then

$$\hat{X}(X) = \{ \varphi(x) : \varphi \in \hat{X} \& x \in X \} .$$

Proposition 4.2 $\hat{X}(X)$ is a subgroup of $\mathbb{T}$.

Proof. Let $G = \hat{X}$. If $G$ contains an element of infinite order, then $\hat{X}(X) = \mathbb{T}$. Otherwise, $\hat{X}(X)$ is the group generated by all $e^{2\pi i/p^n}$ such that $p$ is prime and $G$ contains an element of order $p^n$. □

If $G$ is of finite exponent (= bounded order), then $\hat{X}(X)$ is finite; otherwise, $\text{cl}(\hat{X}(X)) = \mathbb{T}$.

Definition 4.3 The compact abelian group $X$ is nice iff $|\hat{X}| = \aleph_0$ and for all non-empty open $U \subseteq X$ and all $\varepsilon > 0$: $\text{cl}(\hat{X}(X)) \subseteq N_\varepsilon(\varphi(U))$ for all but finitely many $\varphi \in \hat{X}$. Here, $N_\varepsilon(S) = \{ z \in \mathbb{T} : \exists w \in S \ | z - w | < \varepsilon \}$.

Lemma 4.4 If $G = \hat{X}$ is an infinite torsion abelian group and $\{ \varphi \in G : \varphi^k = 1 \}$ is finite for each $k$, then $X$ is nice.

Proof. Note that $\text{cl}(\hat{X}(X)) = \mathbb{T}$, so we fix a non-empty open $U \subseteq X$ and an $\varepsilon > 0$, and we must verify that $N_\varepsilon(\varphi(U)) = \mathbb{T}$ for all but finitely many $\varphi \in \hat{X}$. Observe that $\varphi(X)$ is finite for all $\varphi \in G$. Translating $U$ and shrinking it, we may assume that $U = \{ x \in X : \forall \psi \in F[\psi(x) = 1] \}$, where $F$ is a finite subgroup of $G$. Let $R_m = \{ z \in \mathbb{T} : z^n = 1 \}$, and fix $m$ such that $N_\varepsilon(R_m) = \mathbb{T}$. For all but finitely many $\varphi \in G$, the order of $[\varphi]$ in $G/F$ is at least $m$. Fix any such $\varphi$; then for some $n \geq m$, $\varphi^n \in F$ but $\varphi^k \notin F$ whenever $0 < k < n$. Fix $y \in \text{Hom}(G/F, \mathbb{T})$ such that $y([\varphi]) = e^{2\pi i/n}$; this lifts to an $x \in \hat{G} = \text{Hom}(G, \mathbb{T})$ such that $x(\varphi) = e^{2\pi i/n}$ and $x(\psi) = 1$ for all $\psi \in F$. Identifying $\hat{G}$ with $X$, we have $x \in U$ and $\varphi(x) = e^{2\pi i/n}$; so, since $U$ is a group, $\varphi(U) \supseteq R_n$. Then $n \geq m$ yields $N_\varepsilon(\varphi(U)) = \mathbb{T}$. □

Lemma 4.5 $\hat{G}$ is nice whenever $G$ is one of the groups listed in Lemma 3.1.

Proof. Lemma 4.4 handles the duals of $\sum_{n \in \omega} \mathbb{Z}_{p^n}$ and $\mathbb{Z}_{p^{\omega}}$. For $\mathbb{T} = \hat{\mathbb{Z}}$, note that for a given $U$, $\varphi(U) = \mathbb{T}$ for all but finitely many $\varphi$.

For $G = \sum_{n \in \omega} \mathbb{Z}_p$ and $\hat{G} = (\mathbb{Z}_p)^\omega$, follow the proof of Lemma 4.4. $U$ and $F$ are exactly the same. Now, $\hat{X}(X) = R_p$, and $\varphi(U) = R_p$ for all $\varphi \notin F$. □

We now proceed to prove Theorem 1.9 for nice groups.
Definition 4.6 Let $X$ be a compact 2nd countable abelian group with metric $\rho$ and let $G = \hat{X}$. A nice partition for $(X, \rho)$ is a sequence $\langle \Phi_j : j \in \omega \rangle$ such that the $\Phi_j$ are finite disjoint nonempty sets whose union is $G$ and, if we set

$$\rho_j(x, y) = \rho(x, y) + \sum \left\{ |\varphi(x) - \varphi(y)| : \varphi \in \bigcup_{k \leq j} \Phi_k \right\} ,$$

then for each $j$ and all $\varphi \in \bigcup_{k \geq j+2} \Phi_k$, all $x \in X$, and all $z \in \text{cl}(\hat{X}(X))$, there is a $y \in X$ with $\rho_j(x, y) < 2^{-j}$ and $|\varphi(y) - z| < 2^{-j}$.

Lemma 4.7 If $X$ is a nice compact abelian group with metric $\rho$, then there is a nice partition for $(X, \rho)$.

Proof. List $G$ as $\{ \varphi_j : j \in \omega \}$. Now, define the $\Phi_j$ by induction. Let $\Phi_0 = \{ \varphi_0 \}$. Given $\Phi_k$ for $k \leq j$, we have the metric $\rho_j$ on $X$, so for some finite $m$, we may cover $X$ by open sets $U_0, \ldots, U_m$ of $\rho_j$-diameter less than $\varepsilon := 2^{-j}$. Now choose $\Phi_{j+1}$ so that $\text{cl}(\hat{X}(X)) \subseteq N_{\varepsilon}(\varphi(U_\ell))$ for all $\ell$ and for all $\varphi \in G \setminus \bigcup_{k \leq j} \Phi_k$. Also make sure that $\varphi_j \in \bigcup_{k \leq j+1} \Phi_k$ so that $G$ will be the union of all the $\Phi_j$.

Definition 4.8 Suppose that $\Phi = \langle \Phi_j : j \in \omega \rangle$ is a nice partition for $(X, \rho)$. A sequence $\langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ from $\hat{X}$ is thin (with respect to $\Phi$) iff each $\varphi_n \in \Phi_{j_n}$, where each $j_{n+1} \geq j_n + 2$.

Lemma 4.9 Assume that $\langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ is a thin sequence, $\omega$ is partitioned into two infinite sets, $A, B$, and $a, b \in \text{cl}(\hat{X}(X))$. Then for some $x \in X$,

$$\varphi_n(x) \underset{n \in A}{\to} a \quad \text{AND} \quad \varphi_n(x) \underset{n \in B}{\to} b .$$

Proof. Choose $x_n \in X$ for $n \in \omega$ as follows: $x_0, x_1$ are arbitrary. Given $x_{n-1}$ with $n \geq 2$, use $\varphi_n \in \bigcup_{k \geq j_{n-1}+2} \Phi_k$, plus $j_{n-1} \geq 2(n-1) \geq n$, to get $x_n$ to satisfy:

- $\rho_{j_{n-1}}(x_{n-1}, x_n) < 2^{-n}$.
- $n \in A \Rightarrow |\varphi_n(x_n) - a| < 2^{-n}$.
- $n \in B \Rightarrow |\varphi_n(x_n) - b| < 2^{-n}$.

Then each $\rho(x_{n-1}, x_n) < 2^{-n}$, so $\langle x_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ converges to some $x$. Now, fix $n \geq 1$, and we estimate $|\varphi_n(x_n) - \varphi_n(x)|$: For all $m > n$, $|\varphi_n(x_{m-1}) - \varphi_n(x_m)| \leq \rho_{j_{m-1}}(x_{m-1}, x_m) < 2^{-m}$. Thus, $|\varphi_n(x_n) - \varphi_n(x)| \leq \sum_{m=n+1}^{\infty} 2^{-m} = 2^{-n}$.

Now, if $n \in A$, then

$$|\varphi_n(x) - a| \leq |\varphi_n(x_n) - \varphi_n(x)| + |\varphi_n(x_n) - a| \leq 2^{-n} + 2^{-n} \to 0 .$$

The argument is the same for $n \in B$. □
Lemma 4.10 Let $X$ be a compact 2\textsuperscript{nd} countable abelian group with metric $\rho$ and let $G = \hat{X}$. Suppose that $\Phi = \langle \Phi_j : j \in \omega \rangle$ is a nice partition for $(X, \rho)$ and $\varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$, where each $\varphi_n \in \Phi_{3n}$. Let $B_\ell$, for $\ell \in \omega$, be any infinite subsets of $G$. Then $D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi} \not\subseteq \bigcup_{\ell} \tilde{C}_{B_\ell}$.

\textbf{Proof.} By a standard diagonal argument, get $\varphi'_n$ for $n \in \omega$ and $E, F \subseteq \omega$ such that:

1. $\langle \varphi'_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ is thin with respect to $\Phi$.
2. $d(\{n : \varphi'_n = \varphi_n\}) = 1$.
3. $E \cup F = \omega$ and $E \cap F = \emptyset$.
4. $d(E) = 1$.
5. For each $\ell$, both $\{n \in E : \varphi'_n \in B_\ell\}$ and $\{n \in F : \varphi'_n \in B_\ell\}$ are infinite.

Fix $z \in \hat{X}(X) \setminus \{1\}$. By (1)(3), we may apply Lemma 4.9 and fix $x \in X$ such that $\varphi'_n(x) \xrightarrow{n \in E} 1$ \hspace{1cm} AND \hspace{1cm} $\varphi'_n(x) \xrightarrow{n \in F} z$.

By (2)(4), $x \in D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$. By (5), $x \not\in \tilde{C}_{B_\ell}$ for each $\ell$. \qed

Lemma 4.11 Suppose that $\Phi = \langle \Phi_j : j \in \omega \rangle$ is a nice partition for $(X, \rho)$ and $\varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ from $\hat{X}$ is thin with respect to $\Phi$. Let $B = \{\varphi_n : n \in \omega\}$. Then $C_B$ is dense in $X$, so that $D_{\mathcal{F}_\varphi}$ is dense in $X$.

\textbf{Proof.} This is similar to the proof of Lemma 4.9. Fix a non-empty open $U \subseteq X$. We must produce an $x \in U$ such that $\varphi_n(x) \rightarrow 1$. We may assume that $q \in X$ and $r \in \omega$ and $U = \{x \in X : \rho(x, q) < 2^{-r+1}\}$. Choose $x_n \in X$ for $n \in \omega$ as follows: $x_0 = x_1 = \cdots = x_r = q$. Given $x_{n-1}$ with $n \geq r + 1$, get $x_n$ to satisfy:

- $\rho_{jn-1}(x_{n-1}, x_n) < 2^{-n}$.
- $|\varphi_n(x_n) - 1| < 2^{-n}$.

Then $\langle x_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ converges to some $x$ with $\rho(x, q) \leq 2^{-r}$, so $x \in U$. As in the proof of Lemma 4.9, $|\varphi_n(x) - 1| \rightarrow 0$. \qed

\textbf{Proof of Theorem 1.9.} By Lemmas 4.10 and 4.11, the theorem holds for all nice groups, which by Lemma 4.5, includes the duals of all the groups listed in Lemma 3.1. Then, by Lemma 3.2, the theorem holds for all $X$. \qed

Note that not every $X$ with a countable dual is nice; see Example 5.2.
5 Remarks and Examples

The proof in §2 that $\tilde{D}_{\varphi}$ is null makes essential use of asymptotic density, via Lemma 2.2; one cannot replace $\varphi$ by an arbitrary filter $F$, since $\tilde{D}_{\varphi}$, or even the smaller $D_{\varphi}$, might be all of $X$. By Proposition 1.2 of [7] and Lemma 1.2:

**Proposition 5.1** If $X$ is any infinite compact abelian group, then there is a free filter $F$ on $\hat{X}$ such that $F$ contains a countable set and $D_{\varphi} = X$.

It is not clear whether the nice groups are of interest in their own right, or just an artifact in the proof of Theorem 1.9. Not every dual of a countable discrete abelian group is nice:

**Example 5.2** $\mathbb{Z}_4 \times (\mathbb{Z}_2)^\omega$ is not nice.

**Proof.** Elements of $X = \mathbb{Z}_4 \times (\mathbb{Z}_2)^\omega$ are of the form $\langle x, \bar{y} \rangle$, where $x \in \mathbb{Z}_4 = \{1, i, -1, -i\}$, $\mathbb{Z}_2 = \{ \pm 1 \}$, and $\bar{y} \in (\mathbb{Z}_2)^\omega$. $\hat{X}(X) = \{1, i, -1, -i\}$. Let $\varphi_n(x, \bar{y}) = x \cdot y_n$. Let $U = \{ \langle x, \bar{y} \rangle : x = i \}$. Then the $\varphi_n$ are distinct characters, and $\varphi_n(U) = \{ \pm i \}$, so Definition 4.3 fails whenever $\varepsilon < \sqrt{2}$. □

All the “$C$” and “$D$” sets discussed in this paper are Borel:

**Proposition 5.3** Let $X$ be any compact abelian group. If $B \subseteq \hat{X}$ is countably infinite, then $C_B$ and $\tilde{C}_B$ are $F_{\sigma\delta}$ sets. If $\varphi = \langle \varphi_n : n \in \omega \rangle$ is a sequence of distinct elements of $\hat{X}$, then $D_{\varphi}$ and $\tilde{D}_{\varphi}$ are $F_{\sigma\delta}$ sets.

**Proof.** Let $B = \{ \varphi_n : n \in \omega \}$. Then $x \in \tilde{C}_B$ iff

$$\forall r \in \omega \exists s < r \exists k \in \omega \forall m > k \left[ |\varphi_m(x) - e^{2\pi i s/r}| \leq \frac{\pi}{r} \right],$$

since $\mathbb{T} \subseteq \bigcup_{s < r} N_{\frac{\pi}{r}}(e^{2\pi i s/r})$. This displays $\tilde{C}_B$ as a countable intersection of $F_\sigma$ sets. The argument for $C_B$ is similar; just replace $s$ by 0. Likewise, $x \in \tilde{D}_{\varphi}$ iff

$$\forall r \in \omega \exists s < r \exists k \in \omega \forall n > k \left[ \frac{1}{n} \left| \left\{ m < n : |\varphi_m(x) - e^{2\pi i s/r}| \leq \frac{\pi}{r} \right\} \right| \geq 1 - \frac{1}{r} \right].$$

Again, replace $s$ by 0 to see that $D_{\varphi}$ is an $F_{\sigma\delta}$ set. □

It is natural to ask whether the countable $\{ B_\ell : \ell \in \omega \}$ from Theorem 1.9 could be replaced by a family of $\aleph_1$ sets. Under CH, this is clearly false, since then $|X|$ may be $\aleph_1$, in which case Theorem 1.4 implies that a union of the
form $\bigcup_{\alpha<\omega_1} C_{B_\alpha}$ can be all of $X$. Assuming Martin’s Axiom (MA), the proof of Theorem 1.9 implies that our $D_F$ is not a subset of any union of the form $\bigcup_{\alpha<\kappa} C_{B_\alpha}$ where $\kappa < 2^{\aleph_0}$. To see this, note that the countability of the family $\{B_\ell : \ell \in \omega\}$ was only used in two places. First, in handling Case 2 of Lemma 3.2, we used the fact that a compact group $K$ is not covered by $\aleph_0$ null sets, and MA lets us replace the “$\aleph_0$” by “$< 2^{\aleph_0}$”. Second, the diagonal argument in the proof Lemma 4.10 will work with families of size less than $2^{\aleph_0}$ under MA.

It is also consistent with ZFC to have $2^{\aleph_0}$ arbitrarily large but $T = \bigcup_{\alpha<\omega_1} C_{B_\alpha}$. This proof resembles the standard construction of an ultrafilter of character $\aleph_1$ (see [11], Exercise VIII.A10). Start with $2^{\aleph_0}$ large in the ground model $V$ and iterate forcing $\aleph_1$ times with finite supports, forming $V_\alpha$ for $\alpha \leq \omega_1$. When $\alpha < \omega_1$, let $F_\alpha \in V_\alpha$ be a filter on $\mathbb{Z} = \hat{T}$ obtained from Proposition 5.1, and get $B_\alpha \in V_{\alpha+1}$ so that $B_\alpha \subset^* A$ for all $A \in F_\alpha$. One can even make the $B_\alpha$ generate a $\aleph_0$-point ultrafilter, so that in the final model $V_{\omega_1}$, the $F$ of Proposition 5.1 could be a $\aleph_1$-point of character $\aleph_1$. To do this, make sure that each $B_\alpha$ is chosen so that 0 is a limit point of $B_\alpha$ in the Bohr topology of $\mathbb{Z}$. Note that the $F$ of Proposition 5.1 can never be a selective ultrafilter, since it would then contain thin sets and run afoul of Lemma 4.9.

References


REFERENCES


